The Humanitarian Impact of UN Arms Embargoes Can Arms Embargoes End or Limit Violent Conflict?



(Liberian government propaganda poster)

EJ Hogendoorn, Ph.D.

Research: Statistical Analysis and Case Studies

- Data set of 125 civil conflicts since World War II
- Case studies of four embargoed conflicts
 Bosnia
 - Liberia
 - Sierra Leone
 - Somalia

Why Embargoes Matter

- Arms embargoes are a popular policy option.
- Since 1990, the UN Security Council has declared 20 mandatory arms embargoes
 - Of these 11 were imposed to end or limit fighting. Nine were impartial, imposed on all parties.
- Ending conflict quickly would save lives, money, and lost development.

Theoretical Goals of Arms Embargoes

- Containment
- Deterring or compelling changes in behavior
- Establishing peace

Official Goals of Humanitarian Arms Embargoes

- "for the purposes of establishing peace and stability in Somalia" Res. 733 (1992)
- "for the purposes of establishing peace and stability in Liberia" Res. 788 (1992)
- ""for the purposes of establishing peace and stability in Kosovo" Res. 1160 (1998)

Why it is Difficult to Influence War



- Small arms and light weapons
- Modern transportation and communication
- Propensity to stalemate
- Weak states and resilient insurgencies

Prevailing Arms Embargo Theory

 Prevailing—but rarely analyzed—theory of how arms embargoes would operate is quite simple and intuitively plausible
 □ Effective arms embargo → less arms → less fighting → peace or at least less destruction

Flawed Assumptions

- 1. The UN can impose an entirely "effective" arms embargo
- 2. Fewer/less sophisticated arms necessarily result in less fighting and less death and destruction
- 3. Arms embargoes will change the political calculations of combatants



Impact of Arms Embargoes: Part I

Impartial arms embargoes often result in stalemate and prolonged conflict

Formal or *de facto* partial embargoes can help shift military dynamics and political calculations

Impact of Arms Embargoes: Part II

Importance of impartial vs. partial arms embargoes Disproportionate supply of arms impacts relative military power

Table 1: The Military Impact of Arms Embargoes on Armed Combatants								
C	D 1		01		7			

Type of arms embargo	<i>Relative military power</i> <i>among combatants when</i> <i>embargo imposed</i>	Change in relative military power among combatants
Impartial embargo	Equal (stalemate)	Equal (stalemate)
Impartial embargo	Unequal (advantage better armed combatant)	Unequal (advantage better armed combatant)
Partial embargo	Equal (stalemate)	Unequal (advantage non- embargoed combatant)
Partial embargo	Unequal (advantage better armed combatant)	Unequal or equal (better armed combatant even greater advantage or weaker combatant gaining advantage)

Impact of Arms Embargoes: Part III

- Unintended consequences of arms embargoes
 - Strengthen aggressor
 - Proliferation of factions
 - An arms embargo impacts the type of arms supplied to combatants
 - Criminalization and co-option

Case Study: Bosnia



- Initial Serb advantage
- UN increases pressure on Serbs
- Strategic stalemate
- UN ignores increasing Bosnian-Muslim violations
- Change military balance
- U.S. pressure for settlement

Case Study: Liberia



Taylor's initial advance on Monrovia stopped by ECOMOG intervention Taylor's again nearly takes Monrovia—stopped by strengthened ECOMOG and arms embargo Impact of arms embargo

Stalemate

Taylor "wins" elections

Resumption of war

"Enhanced" embargo de facto only enforced against Taylor

 Taylor goes into exile as LURD and MODEL on outskirts of Monrovia

Case Study: Somalia



- Abundance of arms
- UN arms embargo imposed
- International military intervention
- Continued flow of arms
- Factors undermining arms embargo
- Perverse and unintended consequences

Conclusion: "Do No Harm," Need for a UN Strategy

- Arms embargoes are not irrelevant. May not "work," but arms embargoes do have important impact on conflict
 - Unrealistic goals
- Need for comprehensive strategic approach not piecemeal
 - Enforcement necessary, but not sufficient
 - May need to choose a side
- Role of Secretary-General and UN Secretariat