

Not for citation without
the author's permission

NUMBER 65

**VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN IN POST-COMMUNIST
SOCIETIES: BENEFITS AND CHANGES**

Vesna Nikolic-Ristanovic

May 2001

EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

This essay is one of a series of Occasional Papers published by East European Studies at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars in Washington, DC. The series aims to extend the work of East European scholars and specialists to all those interested in the region and to help authors obtain constructive criticism of work in progress. Occasional Papers are written by resident scholars at the Wilson Center as well as by visiting speakers. They are papers presented at or resulting from discussions, seminars, colloquia, and conferences held under the auspices of East European Studies.

The most current Occasional Papers as well as a list of Occasional Papers are available on the EES web site: <http://www.wilsoncenter.org/ees>. Printed copies of papers may also be obtained free of charge by contacting the EES offices:

East European Studies
The Woodrow Wilson Center
One Woodrow Wilson Plaza
1300 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004-3027

(tel) 202-691-4000; (fax) 202-691-4001
kneppm@wwic.si.edu

Established in 1985 as the East European Program at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars, EES provides a center in Washington, DC, where advanced research on Eastern Europe could be pursued by qualified scholars; where encouragement and support could be given to the cultivation of East European studies throughout the country; and where contact could be maintained with similar institutions abroad. Renamed East European Studies in 1989, it also seeks to provide a meeting place for East European scholars, government officials, analysts, and other specialists and practitioners in the field and related areas. This effort to bridge the gap between academic and public affairs has resulted in novel and stimulating approaches to a wide range of topics in East European studies.

EES is supported by contributions from U.S. Department of State's Program for Research and Training on Eastern Europe and the Independent States of the Former Soviet Union (Title VIII), foundations, corporations, and individuals. The viewpoints expressed in these publications reflect the views of the author and not necessarily those of the U.S. Department of State. East European Studies staff who contribute to the preparation of Occasional Papers are Martin C. Sletzinger, Director; Sabina A-M. Crisen, Program Associate; and Meredith Knepp, Program Assistant.

NUMBER 65

**VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN IN POST-COMMUNIST
SOCIETIES: BENEFITS AND CHANGES**

Vesna Nikolic-Ristanovic

VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN IN POST-COMMUNIST SOCIETIES: BENEFITS AND CHANGES¹

VESNA NIKOLIC-RISTANOVIC is a Senior Researcher at the Institute for Criminological and Sociological Research, Belgrade, Yugoslavia.

Social changes, which recently occurred in post-communist countries, brought new opportunities for positive developments and offered the possibility of choice. In most countries, the social transition brought an opening of borders, enabling an influx of positive as well as negative influences. However, even the general positive impact of social changes is typically followed by more negative consequences in the everyday life of the people. The most dramatic consequences of social transition, manifested in a significant rise of unemployment and the loss of many social benefits. These developments are directly related to the replacement of planned, centralized economies by the market and the privatization of state property. Most people lost their previous social security benefits and, despite the fact that the general character of communism was “equality in poverty,” the social transition was a source of serious stress and numerous existential problems. This was further intensified by the fact that, at the same time, the growing import of both material goods and the American way of thinking, i.e. consumerism spirit of the West, urged people to achieve their “American dreams” at any cost.

However, the precise manifestations of social changes differ very much from country to country. The manner in which social change is manifested depends on the level of economic development achieved in the communist period, the model of communism accepted (Soviet or Yugoslav), and the degree of its influence in specific country. Additionally, the existence and nature of other global social developments such as nationalistic movements and armed conflicts, create specific features in the transition processes of some countries. However, social changes do not affect all people in the same way.

¹ This paper was first presented at the 10th World Society of Victimology symposium on August 6-11, 2000 in Montreal, Canada.

Many academics have already pointed out the impact of social changes on gender issues in post-communist countries. Watson, for example, argued that the transformation of the relationship between the public and private spheres lies at the heart of the process of change in Eastern Europe, and that the exclusion of women and the degrading of feminine identity are not contingent to, but rather a fundamentally constitutive feature of, the democratization of Eastern Europe. She also points out that this contrasts with existing accounts of social transition which have focused exclusively on the reconstruction of the public sphere, ignoring not only issues of gender, but also the functioning of “real society” in general. (Watson, 1993) However, as many authors have argued, there are clear empirical indications that gender relations are also in transition – the rate of female participation in the new democratic parliaments is less than in state socialism, women are overrepresented among those who are unemployed, reproductive rights achieved during socialism were challenged, domesticity of women is widely projected as a social virtue, pornography became a new symbol of freedom, and the marketing of women’s bodies is rising. The creation of a civil society and market economy in Eastern Europe fundamentally entails the construction of a “man’s world” and the simultaneous propagation of masculinity in the public sphere with domestication and the marketing of women. The degradation of feminine identity is an inevitable corollary of this process. (Watson, 1993)

In the case of Yugoslavia, both social transition and the war as macro processes obviously influenced changes in gender relations on the micro level, which further contributed to different patterns of women’s vulnerability to become victims of violence. Social changes in post-communist countries had a serious impact on women’s vulnerability to different forms of violence, especially to domestic violence, trafficking in women, and sexual harassment in the work place. These influences were mediated by changes in the social and economic status as well as in the gender and ethnic identities of both women and men.

This paper will present the findings of my research entitled “Violence against women and social changes in post-communist societies,” conducted during 1999 in Hungary, Macedonia, Bulgaria and Serbia.² I will focus my analysis on findings regarding both the negative and positive impact of changes on women’s vulnerability to and protection from domestic violence. The paper is based on both quantitative and qualitative analysis of interviews with 86 people (58 women and 28 men),³ 45 professionals and women’s

² I wish to thank the Guggenheim Foundation for funding this research as well as all of my interviewees for their willingness to speak with me and my research assistants.

³ Interviewed people were between 30 and 60 years old. Apart from the age, factors taken into consideration when the sample was created are marital status and employment. Bearing in mind that the main subject of the research is the examination of the influence of social changes on everyday life and women’s vulnerability to domestic violence, the sample included only people who were married or recently divorced. The structure of the sample regarding employment was determined on the basis of the type of employment the husband held. This is due to the fact that preliminary research suggested the hypothesis that men’s social and economic position was a better indicator of domestic violence than the women’s social status. Starting from this hypothesis, a sample was constructed to include women whose husbands are unemployed, employed in state institutions and private entrepreneurs, as well as men who belong to each group.

groups activists, documentation of victim support organizations, and media and research reports from the above mentioned countries.

I. Domestic Violence in Hungary, Bulgaria, Macedonia and Serbia: Prevalence and Characteristics

Research recently conducted in Hungary, Macedonia, Bulgaria and Serbia shows that domestic violence is widespread and a serious problem in post-communist society with a tendency to increase and become even more severe. All research findings seem to provide evidence for the assumption that everyday life changes brought on by the transition from a planned to a market economy, further aggravated in some countries by ethnic conflicts and war, contributed significantly to women's vulnerability to violence at home. Impoverishment and unemployment became the most significant risk factors for women's vulnerability to domestic violence and contributed to the decrease of possibilities for women to leave the violent man. If we add to that slow legal and policy changes, widespread corruption and prejudices related to domestic violence, as well as a strong patriarchal tradition in the countries under examination, the situation where women who are victims of domestic violence find themselves can be best described as hopeless.

Hungary

Research carried out in Hungary in 1998 is one of the rare prevalence studies done in Eastern Europe.⁴ The study was based on a representative sample of 1010 women over 18 from different regions of Hungary. Thirteen percent of the women said that their husbands have beaten them (usually more than once) and twenty-two percent said that their male partner has threatened them with violence. Nine percent of the respondents stated that domestic violence happened to a friend of theirs. As Toth points out, they may also be the victims themselves but found it easier to talk in the third person. Ten percent said that they had been raped by a partner. The same research also suggests that alcohol plays a major role in cases of domestic violence. Respondents also often mentioned jealousy, difficult economic conditions, and unemployment as excuses for violence. In addition, research findings show that unemployed and economically dependent women prevail among victims of spouse abuse. The research also gives evidence about the range of spouse abuse in the past, i.e. during socialist time; findings suggest that every fifth woman has witnessed her father beating her mother. (Federer, 1999)

According to Morvai's estimates, in Hungary, about fifty women die every year as a result of domestic violence, while approximately every tenth woman is beaten by her husband/partner. (Morvai, 1998:109, 111) According to police estimates, the number of women killed by their male partners is between 150-180 yearly. (Wirth, forthcoming)

However, in spite of the fact that domestic violence was a reality for many women during socialism and that it is getting worse with the increase in women's unemployment and the consequent dependence on men brought by recent social changes,

⁴ The research was conducted by Hungarian sociologist Olga Toth.

prejudices about domestic violence are still strong. Accordingly, every seventh woman from Toth's research said that even if the husband beats his wife brutally, it is a private matter. Also, every fourth Hungarian woman believes sexual violence within marriage does not exist, i.e. the wife should always be available to her husband. The study also investigated whether respondents know about the recent criminalization of marital rape. Although surprisingly for the researchers, more than half of the respondents had heard about it, forty-five percent had never heard of this important regulation. (Federer, 1999) Hungarian women only rarely ask the help of authorities. The majority of women (65 percent) explain this phenomenon as a manifestation of a woman's feeling of shame. The second reason often mentioned by women is fear, which seems to be founded. Namely, many women pointed out that abused women become even more defenseless after they reported the husband's brutal violence. Consequently, they think that it is hopeless to turn to the authorities without more efficient protection for the victims.

Bulgaria and Macedonia

Research on domestic violence as a human rights abuse, conducted by the Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights in both Bulgaria and Macedonia, also show that domestic violence is a serious and widespread problem. (Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 1996, 1998) In addition, these studies suggest that there are no appropriate legal solutions for the protection of victims of domestic violence, that the police react inappropriately, and that courts do not take seriously their obligation to punish the perpetrator of violence. There are no statistics on domestic violence and the national governments do not provide any social services to victims of domestic violence. The research suggests that main predictors of domestic violence in Bulgaria and Macedonia are the traditional subordination of women and their economic dependence on men. Research on domestic violence in the Varna region (Bulgaria) confirms that domestic violence seriously affects women in Bulgaria. The research is based on the analyses of medical documentation for 1546 medical examinations of victims of domestic violence conducted during 1996, 1997 and 1998. The analyses show that the majority of victims of domestic violence were women (81.6 percent) with women from age 20-40 being the most vulnerable (50.9 percent). The majority of perpetrators are husbands (65.2 percent). However, apart from husbands, children (13 percent) and other members of the family (18.5 percent) also appear as perpetrators. Research findings also show that there is a rise in cases where old parents are victims of their own children, suggesting that, in these cases, violence is mainly connected to the economic dependence of adult children. (Radoinova, unpublished).

Research based on interviews with 491 (male and female) students from Skopje (Macedonia) show that thirty-five percent all respondents and thirty-three percent of female respondents witnessed domestic violence in some period of their life. Twenty percent of male respondents and sixteen percent of female respondents answered that domestic violence was present in their own home. Although this research suggests that domestic violence is widespread in Macedonia, it unfortunately does not distinguish between different kinds of domestic violence according to the relationship between victim and perpetrator. However, like in the Hungarian and Bulgarian studies, this

research also suggests that financial difficulties and unemployment are important contributing factors for domestic violence. (ESE, 1997) These findings are supported by another study conducted in Macedonia, which shows that marital and family conflicts (violence included), correlates with financial problems of the family. (Coneva and Darkovski, 1995:16)

Serbia

The only prevalence study on domestic violence carried out in Serbia is the research on spouse abuse conducted in 1993. The research was based on the sample of 192 women chosen at random from the general population in Belgrade. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, 1998) More than a half of the women (112 or 58.3 percent) from the sample reported that they were victims of some kind of spouse abuse. Ninety-four or forty-nine percent of the women reported psychological violence while thirty-six or 18.7 percent of the women reported that they were victims of wife battery. Also, 18.7 percent of the women reported that they were being raped by their husbands.

Wife battery was usually followed by other kinds of violence. Women who were battered by their husbands were simultaneously victims of psychological abuse (38.9 percent), sexual violence (25 percent), or victims of both of these abuses (52.8 percent). Most often, women reported that the reasons for their husband's violent behavior against them were quarrels regarding money (14.3 percent) or parents (10.4 percent). Other reasons often reported by women were quarrels regarding children and the husband's alcoholism and jealousy. Even women who acknowledged that they were beaten often did not accept the labeling it violence and avoided answering more concrete questions. Similar to the findings of Toth's research in Hungary, these results may prove the high degree of tolerance of violence as a consequence of the generally strong patriarchal structure of the Yugoslav family, e.g. learning that it is normal for a woman to suffer violence, especially psychological violence, from her husband.

Research based on the analyses of cases reported to the Belgrade *SOS Hotline for Battered Women and Children* and the *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence*, show that in Serbia, apart from social transition, changes connected to ethnic conflicts and NATO bombing also had an impact on women's vulnerability to domestic violence. For example, the *SOS Hotline* survey suggests that, although molesters are most often actual husbands and partners (65 percent) or former husbands and partners (13.3 percent), since the beginning of war in 1991, the number of violent sons has been increasing (from 6.4 percent in 1991 to 8.7 percent in 1995), reaching its highest point in 1993.⁵ 11.4 percent of the women reported death threats twice more often in 1993 than in previous years. The use of weapons in domestic violence also increased with the beginning of the war. After the start of the war, about forty percent of the women who called the *SOS Hotline* reported that their partners were threatening them with pistols, bombs and similar weapons. (Mršević, 1999) One recent analysis of cases reported to the *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence*

⁵ This was the year when the war in Bosnia culminated, as well as the year when in Serbia, inflation reached an enormous rate and the level of crime reached its highest point.

in Belgrade, covering a two-year period (June 1996-June 1998), showed that 652 women victims of domestic violence called or came to ask for help (once or several times). Fifty-two percent of the women who asked for help reported both psychological and physical violence, while 30.2 percent were solely victims of physical violence. In this latter instance, only the most serious consequences of violence were reported, such as a broken nose, ribs, teeth etc. 10.1 percent suffered only psychological violence. Most often, the abusers were husbands (70.2 percent), sons (7 percent) and fathers (4.2 percent). In 3.06 percent of all cases, violence was related to refugee status, while violence committed by ex-soldiers was reported only in four (0.6%) cases, which is understandable since it was the period between the end of war in Bosnia and the beginning of conflicts in Kosovo. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, Milivojevic, 2000)

The analysis of cases reported to the *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence* during the NATO bombing demonstrates that more women asked for help during the bombing than in previous periods: fifty-four compared to forty-six. Also, the combination of emotional and physical abuse was reported more often than in previous periods: thirty-four in comparison to twenty-seven cases respectively. Women who asked for help during the bombing reported only violence by men who were not engaged in the army, i.e. who remained at home. Women mainly reported long-term violence, which either continued with the same intensity or became worse during the bombing. In a few instances, women mentioned that domestic violence started at the time of the bombing. The abuse of alcohol as a contributing factor in domestic violence increased during the bombing to 10.7 percent. Women often stated that their husbands' and sons' increased consumption of alcohol was caused by the fear of bombing and "long hours," since they stopped working when the bombing started. (Milivojevic, 1999)

II. Changes in Everyday Life and Violence Against Women

Previous research already drew attention to the impact of everyday life changes caused by social transition and war to women's vulnerability to domestic violence. However, these research findings give only superficial insight and do not illustrate details about the different patterns of the impact changes of everyday life have on women's vulnerability to domestic violence. Moreover, the research does not show how everyday life changes affect gender identities. This is essential for understanding the multiple and complex connections between social changes and violence against women in the home. However, although gender norms and changes in gender identities are considered an important causal factor of domestic violence in all societies (Schure, 1987), their impact is especially emphasized in those societies in crisis and transition.

It is obvious that a more detailed analysis is necessary if we want to understand how changes in everyday life influence women's victimization in the home. To shed more light on this complex issue, I used both qualitative (main) and quantitative (supplementary) analyses of various sources of information about domestic violence, including domestic murders in Hungary, Serbia, Macedonia and Bulgaria.

My research findings suggest that social changes, such as social transition and war, are mirrored in all spheres of life and that they significantly affect personal relationships thereby, creating situations in which domestic violence is likely to occur. Changes which occur on the macro level provoke micro level changes which negatively affect both the women's vulnerability to violence and the possibility to leave the molester and get protection. Although marital relationships are primarily affected, disturbances of relationships between children and parents and among in-law relatives are also frequent and may lead to violence. This latter instance is especially characteristic of Serbia and Macedonia, where the economic situation seems to be the most severe and, consequently, the trend that several generations live together (Trajkovski, 1998) the most frequent in comparison to other examined countries. In Serbia and, during the NATO bombing in Macedonia as well, the situation was even more complicated in families who accepted refugees. In this case, the worsening economic and housing conditions, i.e. serious disturbance of family life caused by influx of refugees, sometimes led to violence. Consequently, women were vulnerable to violence from their partners, adult sons and sometimes daughters (including sons-in-law and daughters-in-law) as well as from their fathers, fathers-in-law and other in-law relatives living with them.

Vulnerability to Domestic Violence

Economic changes as well as changes related to ethnic conflicts and war bear strong influences on the way people live together. The negative consequences on relationships within the family were clearly demonstrated in interviews with people in the four countries under examination, where 69.8 percent of respondents said that their family relationships were getting worse during the last ten years. In addition, only 31.7 percent described this worsening as tensions, while 68.3 percent said their relationships were seriously disturbed, often including psychological violence. Moreover, 86.2 percent of the respondents also know families where relationships got worse recently.

Relationships worsened mainly when the husband, wife, or both of them lost their job, when the husband had difficulty finding a job, or when the husband or wife started a private business, and/or when their financial and/or housing situation worsened. On the other hand, getting rich quickly was also a contributing factor for the deterioration of relationships, especially when the husband is *nouveau riche*. In Serbia, the worsening of relationships between partners was also connected to the disturbance of inter-ethnic relationships affecting mixed marriages, to men's decision to go to war and then return home, to difficulties brought on by the refugee influx, as well as to the general feeling of insecurity and existential fears connected to the political situation and the NATO bombing of Serbia. Similarly, the deterioration of relationships between adult children and parents, as well as with relatives in-law was connected to financial difficulties, unemployment or the lack of job prospects, poor housing situations, the cohabitation of several generations, as well as drug addiction, and a relative's return from fighting in the war. Data from all sources suggest that sudden and quick changes in the social and economic status led to difficulties in the fulfillment of traditional gender roles for both women and men and did not allow the space necessary to get accommodated to the new

situation. The result is stress in men and depression, anxiousness, and low self-esteem in women. (Anderson, 1988)

According to interviews, the breakdown of relationships also included physical violence (mainly on the side of the male partner's with few cases of violent sons and in-laws). 17.4 percent of the respondents stated that physical violence was present in their home, while 46.5 percent said that they knew families where physical violence occurs. There was also a high percentage of cases where the person interviewed did not know whether there was violence in families s/he knew (29 percent). Although respondents mainly spoke about violence against women, in several cases, both women and men mentioned that women were also violent against their husbands.

From interviews and other sources, it is possible to identify four main forms of influence on everyday life changes which have impacted women's vulnerability to violence: violence connected to impoverishment and unemployment; violence connected to challenges of privatization and material success; violence connected to the rise of organized crime; and violence related to disturbance of inter-ethnic relationships and war. These forms of influence are often interconnected and the overall impact is mediated by changes in gender identities, i.e. changes in male identity.

As in Western countries, the characteristics of the man with whom a woman is involved are actually a "better predictor of a woman's odds of being victimized by violence than are the characteristics of the woman herself." (Browne, 1987) Economic changes brought on by the transition period had two main effects on men's social status and masculinity. On one hand, the better social and economic position of some men – often connected to their more frequent participation in private business and illegal activities as well as to the fact that their access to jobs in general is better than that of women – led to the intensification of male identity and a renewed traditionalism of gender roles within family. On the other hand however, the decrease of the social and economic status of a large portion of men as well as the increase in status incompatibility,⁶ social stress, and social isolation are also strongly related to the risk of wife abuse. For this latter group of men, it is characteristic that crises of masculinity – i.e. the widening gap between social constructs of masculinity and their possibility to fit them – may contribute to their violent behavior in the family.

Poverty and unemployment affect women more than men. Consequently, women are now more likely to be or become dependent on their husbands than before. This model seems to prevail among couples where violence occurs, suggesting a connection between domestication of women and a renewed traditionalism of gender roles on one hand, and domestic violence, on the other hand. This is in accordance with the assumption that traditional gender roles divide women and men from each other (Andersen, 1988), at the same time creating both the favorable context for violence to occur as well as decreasing the economic and social potential for women to leave the molester. (Nikolic-Ristanovic and Milivojevic, 2000) These assumptions also fit with research

⁶ According to Galles, status incompatibility is when the husband, whom society expects to be the head of the family, has less education is less paid than his wife. (Galles, 1997)

findings suggesting that women's economic dependence is one of the most important factors of wife abuse and is directly related to the institution of marriage in its traditional form. (Schure, 1987) In addition, the women, especially educated women, who have experienced economic independence during communism, often feel degraded in the role of housewife. This leads to a decrease in their self-esteem and their ability to resist violence, which combine to make them even more vulnerable to violence.⁷

The connection between macro level changes, the renewed traditionalism of gender roles, and violence against women is confirmed by data examining why women became dependent, the violent men's social and economic position, and the methods used by men to keep wives in violent relationships.

The most common reasons for women's dependence on violent men are: they cannot find a job; they lost the job due to economic changes, either due to their ethnic origin or after becoming refugees; they do not work or left the job because the partner prevented them from working, convinced or forced them to spend more time in the home, or get formally employed in his private enterprise; or they work or retired but earn a disproportionately small amount of money in comparison to the husband. By contrast, the violent husbands of these women are often economically independent and earn enough and sometimes a lot of money. They are involved in both (one or more) legal and illegal work, i.e. shadow economy, have a private business or are in influential positions in state bodies. The extreme examples of the connection of domestic violence to a renewed traditionalism of gender roles and the institution of marriage is found in cases of refugee women who got married to men living in Serbia.

One reason for family disputes and violence is the increase in time men now spend out of the home because of work. Family disputes and violence result from overwork and stress as well as from insecurity in the workplace and potential earnings. Wives' complaints about the men's absence and lack of time for domestic chores and the children may additionally increase the stress and offend newly won male pride. This tension is especially heightened when the man's success in public and absence from the private sphere is confronted with the wife's loss of a job and return home, i.e. limitation of her life to the private sphere. Hence, they are faced with the worst possible mix: a man who is successful but overworked and, a highly educated woman who used to have a regular job is now forced to stay at home as a housewife dependent on her husband. A good illustration is provided by a highly educated woman interviewed in Hungary:

"Practically our conflicts stem from the fact that my husband doesn't want to deal with the family, either with me or the problems related to the renewal. It means he doesn't want to participate in the labor division and actually he's tired...It is interesting that the financial issues usually don't develop to the point of a knife, but rather the division of labor - it means domestic chores, as well as the division of time spent with the children. That causes very ugly conflicts... The financial situation, definitely makes one helpless. Because when a woman stays at home and she doesn't have an income, even if she receives maternal allowances or

⁷ Regina Indshewa, WaD, Bulgaria, the interview was conducted on June 30, 1999.

whatever they call it nowadays, she is still helpless because she cannot say that the income is hers. Now normally, if they really love each other, this doesn't even occur, and what the husband earns is common. But the truth is that the majority of people think that – and this is the normal, average view – what the husband earns is his and he is the master of his house, and many times he stresses that physically as well.”

Another example of a renewed traditionalism is found in marriages of the *nouveau riches*, i.e., those men who got rich shortly after the social transition changes. When they get rich and start to feel powerful they start to isolate women. As pointed out by Nadia Kozuharova⁸ from *Animus Association* (Bulgaria) and Dusko Minkovski from *Skopje Center for Social Work* (Macedonia),⁹ these women are in the position of wealthy housewives, who must stay at home, under control of their partners. Often, in order to confirm their new masculinity, men find lovers and sometimes even bring them home and ask their wives to serve both of them or use other such humiliating practices. Sometimes, violence is limited to the psychological level but it is not so rare that physical and economical violence are also added.

Nouveau riches also include men who got rich over a short period of time through illegal activities during the war or from working as policemen.¹⁰ Other examples include men involved in organized crime, which became increasingly powerful during the transition period. In these relationships, violence is often connected to the increase in masculinity and translates into the subordination, control, and social isolation of the woman. Women who live with these men are in a very delicate situation since they know a lot and live in fear of being killed. They consider their partners omnipotent and do not have support from neighbors who often think that they deserve to be victimized since they stay with Mafia men. In addition, men who are involved in organized crime live in constant fear of mafia violence and tend to ventilate their stress in the home.¹¹ In Hungary, where the prostitution and pornography industries are the most widespread, wife abuse, including coercion to prostitution and use for pornography, is mentioned often by interviewees.

However, not all men who have dependent wives are able to earn enough. In these cases, violence is connected to the husband's inner conflict between the desire to retain the role of family provider and his frustrations at not being able to meet his own and society's expectations. Sometimes, these husbands complain because their wives do not work, but usually they do not allow them to work and improve the family's economic situation since they feel this may hurt their image of masculinity.

During the transition period, men's economic position is more fluid than stable. Changes in men's behavior toward their wives often coincide with changes related to the financial situation of the family. During the transition period, privatization was

⁸ The interview was conducted on November 16, 1999.

⁹ The interview was conducted on July 14, 1999

¹⁰ According to 1996 ICVS carried out in Belgrade, the police is among the most corrupted professions in Serbia (Nikolic-Ristanovic, 1998). Also, police officers were largely involved in ethnic conflicts.

¹¹ Interviews with Nadia Kozuharova (Animus, Bulgaria) on November 16, 1999, and Gyorgyi Toth (NANE, Hungary), on September 1, 1999.

experienced as a big challenge to and test for male identity. Consequently, violence intensified when men failed in private business. One extreme example from Serbia can serve to illustrate this development: At the request of her violent husband, the wife left the job in order to work in his private enterprise. He killed her after experiencing severe financial crises following his business failure.

Impoverishment and job shortage, as well as the loss of former economic and social security affected a large part of the male population, leaving them feeling powerless and inadequate. Being unemployed is devastating to men in a patriarchal society, since it is a clear indication that they are not fulfilling society's expectations as the family's providers. (Gelles, 1997) A strong connection between men's employment and violence in the family has already been established by research in the West. (Gayford, 1975; Prescott & Letko, 1977; Rounsavill, 1978, quoted by Gelles, 1997) This paper suggests that, apart from unemployment, in a post-communist society, men's feeling of inadequacy are also connected to their inability to earn enough money even when legally and/or illegally employed.¹² The decrease in men's economic position and social status leads to crises of male identity. This crisis is sometimes further aggravated by the wives' complaints about the men's inability to fulfill their traditionally expected role of family providers. This development occurs in cases where both spouses are unemployed and/or do not have any earnings or their earnings are insufficient, as well as in cases where only the wife is employed or earning a living. As Radka Valkova from the *Gender Project for Bulgaria* points out:

*"Men are under more stress due to transition stage changes, since when they are unemployed men find themselves in a role which does not fit to traditional expectations. Additionally, they may not be prepared to work something other than their profession. When the man is jobless, I am sure that there will be conflict in the family... When a previously employed wife loses her job, this is a more acceptable situation because of cultural attitudes: men are the ones who earn money for the family and women work or do not work. In this country, women were working for many years not because they wished to work but because they had to work."*¹³

Financial difficulties and economic dependence on others are inherently the sources of stress. To these are added tensions and conflicts between partners. In refugee families in Serbia, the situation is additionally aggravated by trauma caused by war and violent changes in everyday life connected to migration. A special problem exists in families which accepted refugees. Women who have both refugees and violent husbands in their homes report that their husbands became more violent. Also, some women report that their husbands start to be violent after the arrival of refugees. Violence against women in

¹² In post-communist societies, it is necessary to consider employment together with the value of real wages. As a consequence of decrease of real wages, a permanent job often does not mean financial security. To earn a modest living, a large part of the population must take on several additional (legal and/or illegal) jobs. Even in Hungary, where the GDP has almost recovered, the job offer and, especially, real wages are far from the level at the beginning of the transition period. For example, the number of jobs in 1997 was 71 percent of that in 1989, and these jobs paid a pre-earner wage worth 23 percent less in real terms. (UNICEF, 1999)

¹³ The interview was conducted on June 30, 1999.

these situations is often connected to an imbalance created in the family by newcomers, as well as to the worsening of their already bad economic situation. For example, a woman said that her already bad relationship with her husband culminated when his relatives came to live with them as refugees. At once, nine persons started to live together in one apartment and the wife was the only one who earned some money and supported the entire family. Her husband spent his time going to work (only formally since there was no real work and earnings) and escaping from reality by sleeping. He resisted any discussion about household problems and became especially violent when she decided to divorce.

The crisis of masculinity as a contributing factor to violence is especially emphasized when social incompatibility is created by the wife's employment and better financial situation. As pointed out by Albena Koycheva, an attorney lawyer from Bulgaria, the loss of economic balance is a bigger problem than poverty.¹⁴ This is especially visible when the wife decides to start a private business. In these cases, violence is obviously connected to the obliteration of the traditional distribution of economic roles in the household, i.e. with men's desire to regain power by any means. Sometimes, it includes taking and spending all the wife's money, making the wife into a slave, or using the wife's money for alcohol and molesting her after drinking. Men sometimes also use violence to force their wives to sell their property, leaving them without any fallback accommodation or economic security. This kind of economic violence by men who are economically dependent on their wives, is usually followed by physical and psychological violence and was a frequent phenomenon among all countries under examination.

The situation is especially severe when the social situation is opposite to the traditional model of marriage. In these cases, apart from an inability to fulfill the traditional male role of breadwinner, the contributing factors to men's violent behavior are also their frustrations connected to passivity and spending unusually long hours at home. In addition, expectations (and sometimes pressure) by wives husbands assume at least part of the responsibilities for domestic chores and child care, may further aggravate the situation. As Lenke Feher¹⁵ from Hungary points out,

"The woman is overburdened, because in addition to working she must also take care of children and the household since most men are not willing to, even when they are not employed. The men are unwilling 'to take the role of the housewife.' Furthermore, the woman is expected to 'treat the soul' of man who becomes more aggressive, more anxious, and more angry by changing her behavior to try to balance the man's and emphasize the importance of her husband. It is a very difficult situation since all the burden is on the woman in such cases."

In situations when men already feel their masculinity is endangered, women's complaints only make the situation worse. In cases where the man is both unemployed and not able to earn a living, he tends to escape from reality through the use of alcohol. This is another factor which increases women's vulnerability to violence. In cases where violence is

¹⁴ The interview was conducted on November 17, 1999.

¹⁵ The interview was conducted on April 28, 1999.

committed by refugee men against their wives and/or female relatives living in Serbia, men's frustrations resulted from the passivity inherent in the refugee status, which contributes to the desire to compensate for power lost in outside the world by using violence in the family. For example, a woman living in Serbia took in her son and grandson who came to live with her after escaping from Croatia. Her daughter-in-law, who was a Croat, remained in Croatia. The Serbian woman's son and his child became economically dependent on the mother and beat and eventually expelled her from the apartment.

Domestic violence is also connected to family disputes about men's decision to go to war and the ex-soldiers' desire to regain their status in the family. Ex-soldiers may be incapable to control their rage, or may show extraordinarily intensive emotions in normal situations. Additionally, post-war surroundings sometimes transform women into martyrs: they are expected to suffer the consequences of men's post-war trauma. (Andic-Ruzicic, 1999) The crisis of male identity as a contributing factor to domestic violence was also connected to man's feeling of helplessness. This applied to both soldiers and civilians during the NATO bombing of Serbia.

In situations where inter-ethnic relationships are disturbed, as in Serbia, violence is also connected to the wife's belonging to a different ethnic group. The husband may come to see a woman of another nationality as a concrete symbol of "the enemy" and/or as part of his property which has become worthless because of her ethnic origin. The woman becomes a source of the man's shame and problems in interactions with significant persons outside the family. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, 1999) Consequently, the man feels not only that his identity as a man is in danger, but that his ethnic identity is also in danger since his wife's ethnic background is the obstacle to complete social acceptance.

Obstacles to Leaving the Molester and Getting Protection

Research findings suggest serious negative consequences of women's economic dependence on men, not only for women's vulnerability to violence but also for the possibility to leave the violent partner.¹⁶ As stated by Vesna Stanojevic from *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence* in Belgrade (Serbia), economic hardships affect women's potential to find an exit from violence more than they generate violence itself.¹⁷ Many women want to divorce but are not able to provide for themselves and their children.¹⁸ Due to their economic dependence on men and general impoverishment, women often do not have money to pay divorce procedure expenses. Due to poverty, a deteriorating housing situation and the long duration of divorce and common property division procedures (especially in Bulgaria), women must remain with the men they are divorcing for a significant period of time. In these situations, violence often gets worse,

¹⁶ Statistics on divorce in post-communist countries show that divorce rates fell during initial years of the transition, i.e. during the most severe economic crises, and started to rise recently, following positive effects of economic reforms. (UNICEF, 1999)

¹⁷ Interview conducted on March 5, 1999.

¹⁸ Dr. Ljubica Coneva says that the arrival of NATO and UN soldiers in Macedonia had an impact on the increase of prices of rented apartments and, in this way, negatively impacted already bad prospects for victims of violence to leave molesters (interview conducted on July 17, 1999).

but there are cases where earlier nonviolent husbands become violent when he is forced to live in the same apartment with his former wife.

As pointed out by professionals from Serbia and Macedonia,¹⁹ due to the increase of poverty brought on by the economic transition, women's personal resources and their ability to get aid from others decreased. This is especially true when the woman's parents are refugees, as in the case of a woman from Serbia. She wanted to leave her violent husband. However, her economic situation was so desperate that, although she was employed, she did not get any salary for months and did not even have money to pay for an abortion.

Sometimes, support is missing even when members of the family are able to help or at least offer the woman temporary shelter. The reason for that may be fear but also patriarchal expectations for the woman to stay married whatever her relationship with the husband.²⁰ The *United Nations Development Program* in Sofia reports: "It is easy to understand why women beaten by their husbands keep silent on the matter. They feel shame, humiliation and lack of understanding even on the part of their relatives and friends, and finally, the hopelessness of the situation." (quoted from Minnesota Advocates, 1996). Apart from parents, adult sons are often in a position where they can help their mothers, but they sometimes refuse to do it in solidarity with the father or in fear of losing their own material security.

The importance of a woman's economic independence for her ability to leave the molester is underscored in the rare examples of women who succeeded in this action immediately after they got job or started a private business and became economically independent from their husbands.

Apart from economic problems and the lack of family support, women also have difficulty leaving violent husbands due to fear that they may take the children or kill them and the children. One important obstacle in leaving the molester is the inefficiency of the legal system and social services. Women often point out the inefficiency of the police, social welfare agencies, and psychiatrists (in cases of mentally ill husbands). Apart from usual refusals of the police to react in cases of domestic violence, which they consider trivial, the refusals are connected to solidarity with the molester as a colleague or a friend, as well as to corruption. In some cases, the police not only refuse to help but also take the molester's side²¹ and maltreat the women involved. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, Milivojevic, 2000) Corruption was especially stressed by women victims of violence in Serbia, where police officers refused to intervene after men gave them money or gas, or sell them foreign currencies at low prices.²² The inefficiency of the legal system is also

¹⁹ Interview with Nada Polovina, psychologist from Serbia conducted on August 29, 1999, and interview with Dusko Minkovski from Macedonia conducted on July 14, 1999.

²⁰ Interview with Anna Bethlen (Hungary) conducted on May 1, 1999, and with Maria Minkova (Bulgaria) on June 29, 1999.

²¹ Interview with Mirjana Najcevska (Macedonia) conducted on July 17, 1999.

²² Since UN economic sanctions were imposed on Serbia in 1992, the black market started to flourish, including the gas and foreign currency black market. Because selling things and using foreign currency on

obvious in relation to violence connected to men's visitation rights as well as in the absence of any protective measures against the molester. This is particularly true during and after the divorce procedures – women do not feel secure either at home, where they usually live with the molester, or at work, or on the street. Shelters for battered women either do not exist (Macedonia) or there is one for the entire country (Serbia, Bulgaria and Hungary). The case recorded by NANE (a women's organization which supports victims of domestic violence in Hungary) may be a good illustration of how inappropriate legal solutions and a lack of temporary accommodations in transition societies can serve as serious obstacles to women's ability to leave violent husbands, even when they are divorced:

*"The woman left her husband with her one year old daughter and went to live in a small apartment which her parents bought for her. She then applied for divorce. When she moved to this flat, her ex-husband started to come and stalk her. He came every day and molested her, kicked the door, etc. The woman's parents came to live with her, so she would not be alone. The apartment was too small for all of them. She went to the police but they said that they did not want to interfere. Also, according to visitation rights laws, she still had to allow the father to see the child. Once, when she went to pick up the child from the father, her ex-husband raped her. She then called NANE. But the ex-husband still came to the apartment and kicked the door. She did not go to the husband's apartment anymore and, on visitation rights days, they exchanged the child in public places. On one of these occasions, he beat her in a public place. She was also raped again by him. She was a nurse in the hospital and he called the hospital to find out when she was working. Once, when she was going to work, he used a knife and forced her (there were many witnesses) to go to his place, where he raped her very brutally and beat her. He also took photos when he was raping her and then made her sign a document that she was engaging in the act willingly and that she did not want anything from him. He also made her sign a document claiming that she has debts to him. The woman then went to the police. The police came immediately to his apartment and confiscated all the evidence."*²³

Ethnic conflicts, the NATO bombing combined with UN economic sanctions, as well as the almost complete disappearance of the rule of law, and the ensuing long-term political instability of the country, have contributed to make the already mentioned obstacles to women's ability to leave the molester especially severe in Serbia. As pointed out by Vesna Stanojevic,²⁴ even when life with the molester is insupportable, women often postpone the decision to divorce because of general insecurity and uncertainty.²⁵ However, in spite of the war and the general deteriorating economic situation, during the NATO bombing, many women came to *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence* ready for divorce. A similar development was mentioned by refugee women who made the

the domestic market is considered illegal, (although at the same time this is necessity), this creates a large space for police blackmails and corruption.

²³ Interview conducted with Anna Bethlen on May 1, 1999.

²⁴ Interviews conducted on March 5 and August 4, 1999.

²⁵ This was especially emphasized during NATO threats of bombing Serbia in October 1998, which put severe psychological pressure on ordinary, helpless people.

simultaneous decision to leave both the violent husbands and their country. Ironically, a war can also help women leave violent husbands under the pretext of fleeing in refuge to protect themselves and their children. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, 1996) It is known from other wars that crises can empower women and sometimes encourage them to rely less on marriage as a means of support. (Bushra and Lopez, 1993)

III. Prospective for Improving the Position of Women Victims of Domestic Violence

As demonstrated above, economic hardships and the widening of social differences as a result of hasty privatization and transition to a market economy, combined with, on one hand, a renewed traditionalism and, on the other hand, masculinity crises and an upheaval of traditional gender structure in the institution of marriage, led to negative consequences in relationships within marriage, i.e. family. Thus, the costs of changes, in terms of deterioration of interpersonal relationships and violence, seem to be high in all four countries, with people from Serbia and Macedonia in the worst situation since they were additionally affected by ethnic conflicts and the NATO bombing.

However, positive changes are also obvious. These are mainly related to the democratization of political life, including pluralism and new freedoms, which led to the creation of civil society and an increased interest of the West in investing not only in the economies of these countries, but also in the development of human rights, i.e. the improvement of legal systems and policy. In this regard, many long-term, positive changes were initiated just in the field of protection of human rights for women. Especially telling was the creation of women's NGOs and an increased interest among post-communist states (except Serbia) in showing their democratic face to the world by, among other, changing laws and policy regarding violence against women.

After 1990, many organizations (mainly women's NGOs) dealing with domestic violence, were established in Hungary, Serbia, Macedonia and Bulgaria. Their main achievements over the past decade include raising awareness, victim support, education, and advocacy for changing laws and policy regarding violence against women. Women's organizations put the issue of violence against women on the public agenda, suggesting clearly that domestic violence is not a private matter but a serious social problem which needed serious discussion and solutions.²⁶ They also offered new perceptions about violence against women, where deconstructions of traditional stereotypes – putting the blame on the offender (man) instead of the victim (woman) – and concerns about victims and their rights prevail. (Nikolic-Ristanovic, 2001) Although often facing obstacles and without proper understanding, these changed perceptions, which dominate in articles written by or in interviews with women's group activists and feminist scholars, obviously have had an increasing impact on the media's depiction of violence against women.

²⁶ Before this, violence against women was seriously discussed only in Serbia, which is normal if we keep in mind Serbia's earlier openness toward the West as well as the fact that women's movements and feminist ideas, including those developed by feminist scholars in the field of law and victimology, already began in the 1980s.

Professionals and women's groups activists agree that women victims feel they are not alone anymore and that they have some place to turn to for help. As stated by Tatyana Kmetova from Bulgaria, it was very important to show that cases of violence are a reality. "An additional change, achieved owing to women's groups, is that women are now more willing to speak about violence, to ask for help. Once you have examples of battered women trying to find somebody who can help them, that means that the situation is completely changed," says Kmetova.²⁷

The second important change is that, although still rare and far from being able to satisfy all the needs of battered women, organizations offering help and support became a reality in post-communist societies. The existing organizations offer either telephone (SOS hotlines) or both telephone and direct counseling and aid (usually both psychological and legal).²⁸ Rarely, they also accompany women in court. The biggest problem these organizations are faced with is the lack of shelters and women-friendly lawyers.

The number of shelters in Serbia, Hungary and Bulgaria are far from adequate in number to meet the needs of battered women, while in Macedonia there are no shelters at all. Only shelters in Serbia and Bulgaria are run by women's organizations and they are established specifically for battered women, while the only shelter in Hungary is run by the Salvation Army and serves homeless women with children (including battered women but only if they have children). In Serbia, the only shelter²⁹ for battered women is used to also accommodate refugee women. New governments are still not willing to spend money on women's victim support organizations so that they are mainly dependent on foreign funders who usually provide support for some time and then leave.³⁰

Women's organizations made a lot of efforts to educate lawyers, judges and police. They organized a number of seminars, which were well publicized in the media. This kind of education was recently developed in Bulgaria and Macedonia. Bulgaria is still the only country where training for police was organized in a systematic way. Some positive changes in police reaction to domestic violence have since been noticed in Bulgaria and Hungary, while representatives of women's organizations in Macedonia and

²⁷ Interviews conducted on June 29 and 30, 1999.

²⁸ Such women's organizations are: in Serbia – the *SOS Hotline* in Belgrade, Nis, and Kraljevo as well as the *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence* in Belgrade; in Macedonia – the *SOS Hotline* in Skopje and Kumanovo; in Hungary – the *SOS Hotline NANE* and the *Law Office for Women's and Children's Rights*, both in Budapest; in Bulgaria – *Animus* and *Nadja Center* in Sofia, *Demetra* in Bourgas, *Association Support for Women and Children* in Gabrovo, and *SOS for Families in Disgrace* in Varna. There are also general victim support organizations such as the *White Ring* in Hungary and *Doctor X* in Bulgaria.

²⁹ In the meantime, at the end of 2000, a second shelter for battered women was established by *Counseling Service Against Domestic Violence*.

³⁰ For example, a few years ago, Serbia had three shelters. Two of them had to be closed recently due to lack of funding. Although foreign funding of NGOs in Serbia was always poor, thanks to the solidarity of women's groups from different countries, for some time, women's groups managed to cover their expenses and continue their activities. After the NATO bombing, funding became even more limited and selective than earlier, often negatively affecting the activities of women's victim support organizations.

Serbia said they have good relations with a few police stations or with some individual police officers.

Apart from seminars organized by women's organizations, changes in the police's attitude toward domestic violence in Bulgaria are a result of the establishment of a Bulgarian association of police women, which did a lot to raise the awareness of the police about violence against women and, in some way, serve as a mediator between women's organizations and the police. In Hungary, a very important step in changing the attitudes of the police came from the government. The Ministry of Internal Affairs initiated the action to change the behavior of the police toward the victims. This included the training of police officers and the establishment of a Victim Protection Office in the Ministry. Also, in every police office there is at least one officer responsible for victim protection who is supposed to ensure that victims are well treated by the police. Recently, police stations have designated special rooms for hearing victims of domestic violence; these are rooms where other persons do not have access. Also, experimental psychological tests for policemen have been introduced, checking their ability to work with victims.³¹ In January 1999, the Ministry of Internal Affairs gave instructions to all police stations to deal in an appropriate way with cases of family violence, which also included arresting batterers.³²

Legal reforms regarding domestic violence are so far limited to marital rape, which was introduced as criminal offence only in Hungary and Macedonia. In Serbia, the prolonged and continued efforts of the women's advocacy groups resulted in the inclusion of marital rape in the proposal of a new Criminal Code of the FRY. Apart from women's advocacy groups, in both Serbia and Hungary, the development of proposals for legal reforms regarding domestic violence, begun in the 1980s, is related to victimology theory and research. Hungary is the only country where a comprehensive proposal for victim protection was made. The proposal included changes of several laws and a focus on protection of victims of domestic violence, including restraining orders. These laws are expected to be passed by the Parliament in 2002 at latest. As Lenke Feher noticed, "it is very important that the government wants to fulfil international norms and it is the reason why the Ministry of Interior took an interest in the issues. The European Forum for Victim Services, organized in Budapest and highly publicized, also played an important role. Police representatives were invited and all documents of the European forum were translated into Hungarian." It is obvious that, apart from women's advocacy groups, the advocacy of victimologists and the willingness of the Hungarian government to adjust legislation to reflect international standards, coincide with Hungary's strong commitment for EU membership and had a significant impact on the development of the proposal. This willingness of the government to implement reforms is exactly the condition which was missing in Serbia. In spite of serious efforts made by the *Victimology Society of Serbia* to develop a comprehensive model of new legal approaches to domestic violence, including protective orders and the counseling of batterers in

³¹ Interview with Lenke Feher. April 28, 1999.

³² Interview with Anna Bethlen, May 1, 1999

addition to penalties, arrest, and other sanctions for violation of protective orders, the former Serbian government did not show any interest to make changes.³³

Over the last two years, owing to the women's group *ESE*, a large campaign for legal reform was organized in Macedonia. The campaign included media events and a series of seminars for professionals of different occupational backgrounds dealing with domestic violence. The campaign also included a proposal for changes of relevant laws, suggesting harsher penalties for domestic violence, including murder, witness protection and protective orders, all of which are seriously considered by the Macedonian government. Bulgaria is slowest in developing legal changes because the general legal reform is still at the beginning and there is still no consensus among women's advocacy groups about appropriate legal solutions to domestic violence. Also, in spite of awareness-raising campaigns, it seems that the level of awareness in general is still very low in comparison to strong patriarchal attitudes. "The law the situation is the same and the legal system is not very friendly for women that are victims of violence," says Maria Minkova from *Animus Association*. "In Bulgaria, violence against women in the family is not considered a criminal activity. So, our biggest aim is to change this situation. I think it will be hard and it will not happen until the society also changes. The existing law only represents what people think in Bulgaria. And what people think here about family violence is that it is woman's fault."

In all countries, with the exception of Serbia at the time of the survey, there is increasing cooperation between the government and NGOs on the issue of domestic violence. The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action had an obvious impact, leading to the creation of national plans for action and the establishment of special departments or committees for women's issues as part of either the government or the Parliament. However, changes which give real benefits to battered women are slow in coming and still far from being achieved, especially given prevailing inefficiency and the lack of understanding among state agencies. At the moment, it seems that costs of changes in terms of deterioration of relationships in the family and the violence connected to it are higher than long-term benefits of positive changes. It will take a long time until these reforms reach all those in need. The as of yet missing but necessary conditions for these widespread reforms are stabilization of economies, development of rule of law, the end of ethnic conflicts and wars, as well as a change in deeply rooted patriarchal attitudes.

³³ It is worthwhile mentioning that after the NATO bombing, the prospects of the state's acceptance of any NGO initiatives became poorer than ever. Although the government was hostile toward NGOs before the NATO attack, after the bombing, NGOs were openly called traitors and terrorists allegedly paid by NATO to complete the destruction of the country. However, the change in government which occurred in October 2000, provides a more optimistic perspective for changes in that regard.

Bibliography

- Andersen, M. *Thinking About Women: Sociological Perspectives on Sex and Gender*, (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1988).
- Andric-Ruzicic, D. *(Ne) živjeti s nasiljem* ((Not) living with violence), (Zenica: Medica Zenica-Infoteka, 1999).
- Browne, A. *When Battered Women Kill*, (New York and London: the Free Press and Collier Macmillan Publishers, 1987).
- El Bushra, J. and Piza E. Lopez. *Development in Conflict: The Gender Dimension*, Report of an Oxfam AGRA East Workshop held in Pattaya, Thailand (1993).
- Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights. *Domestic Violence in Bulgaria*, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 1996).
- Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights. *Domestic Violence in Macedonia*, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 1998).
- Morvai, K. *Terror a családban: A feleségbántalmazás és a jog* (Terror in the family: violence against women and law), (Budapest: Kossuth Kiado, 1998).
- Mrsevic, Z., "Mesto i uloga domaćeg nasilja u kriznim periodima" (The Place and Role of Domestic Violence in Period of Crises), in M. Delevic-Djilas, A. Jovanovic and S. Nedovic, eds. *Ostvarivanje ekonomskih i socijalnih prava* (Realization of Economic and Social Rights), (Belgrade Center for Human Rights, Belgrade, 1999), 426-446.
- Milivojevic, S., "Nasilje u porodici za vreme agresije NATO na SRJ" (Domestic Violence during NATO aggression on FRY), *Temida* 2, (1999): 45-48.
- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V., "War and Violence Against Women," in J. Turpin and L. Lorentzen. *The Gendered New World Order*, (Routledge: New York and London, 1996), 195-211.
- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V., "Victims and Police in Belgrade," *International Review of Victimology*, 6(1), (1998): 49-63.
- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V., "War and Crime in the former Yugoslavia," in V. Ruggiero, N. South and I. Taylor. *The New European Criminology*, (Routledge: London and New York, 1998), 462-480.
- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V., "Domestic Violence: the Impact of Ethnic Conflicts and War," paper presented at the International Conference "Gender and Militarism," Leeds, (November 1999).

- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V. and Milivojevic, S., "Victimization of Women in the Family: the Impact of Social Factors Connected to Social Changes and Age," *Temida*, 1, (2000): 20-29.
- Nikolic-Ristanovic, V., "Constructions of Identities in Media Images of Violence Against Women," in Jahnert, G. *et al.*, ed. *Gender in Transition in Eastern and Central Europe*, (Berlin: Trafo Verlag, 2001), 284-295.
- Radoinova, D., "Domasno nasilie v varnenski okrug za perioda 1996-1998" (Domestic violence in Varna county), unpublished.
- Schur, E. *Labeling Women Deviant: Gender, Stigma and Social Control*, (London: Random House, 1987):
- Trajkovski, D., "Semejstvoto vo savremeniot sistem na socijalna zastita vo republika Makedonija" (Family in contemporary system of social protection in Republic of Macedonia), in B. Nanevski and V. Stojanova, eds. *Socijalnata sigurnost na naselenieto vo Republika Makedonia vo uslovi na tranzicija* (Social security of people in Republic of Macedonia in conditions of transition), (Skopje: Fridrich Ebert Foundation, 1998), 69-77.
- ESE. *Rhea Silvia*, (Skopje: ESE, 1997).
- Coneva, Lj. and Darkovski, D., "Kriznite sastojbi kaj naselenieto vo republika Makedonija - nacini i formi za nivno nadminuvanje" (Crises situations among people of Macedonia - ways and forms for overcoming them), Skopje: Republicki zavod za unapreduvanje na socijalnite dejnosti (1995).
- Federer, A., "Asszony verve jo?" (Woman is good when beaten?), *Nepszabadsag* (May 6, 1999).
- Gelles, R. *Intimate Violence in Families*, (London: Sage, 1997).
- UNICEF. *Women in Transition*, Regional Monitoring Reports, (6), (Florence: UNICEF, International Child Development Centre, 1999).
- Watson, P., "Eastern European Silent Revolution: Gender," *Sociology*, 27(3), (1993): 471-487.
- Wirth, J. *Women of the World Report - Central and Eastern Europe: Hungary* (forthcoming).